

BACCHYLIDES: *Carmina cum fragmentis*. Edidit HERWIG MAEHLER. Editio undecima. Bibliotheca scriptorum Graecorum et Romanorum Teubneriana. Monachii et Lipsiae in aedibus K. G. Saur 2003. ISBN 3-598-71116-6. LX, 172 S. EUR 19,80.

Dies ist der erste Teubnersche Bakchylides, auf dessen Titelblatt der Name Herwig Maehlers alleine zu lesen ist. In der 1970 erschienenen 10. Auflage stand noch "post Brunonem Snell edidit Hervicus Maehler". Snell hatte seinerzeit die Aufgabe von Fr. Blass und seinem Nachfolger W. Süss geerbt, die Teubneriana des Konkurrenten Pindars auf dem Laufenden zu halten; die 1. Auflage wurde 1898 publiziert. So hat der Verlag Teubner (mit seinen Nachfolgern) dem Bakchylidestext schon über ein Jahrhundert bedeutende Dienste erwiesen. Die neueste elfte Auflage begrüßt man freudig, denn die Bakchylides-Forschung hat große Fortschritte gemacht, an denen Maehler selbst einen nicht geringen Anteil hat (zu nennen vor allem sein 1982–1997 erschienener großer deutschsprachiger Kommentar und eine Auswahl auf Englisch aus dem Jahre 2004). An Zeugen sind neu hinzugekommen der Papyrus R (carm. 28 und Anfang von carm. 29) und Papyrus S (frg. 66). Von jetzt an ist Bakchylides nach dieser Ausgabe zu zitieren.

*Heikki Solin*

ARISTOPHANES IV: *Frogs, Assemblywomen, Wealth*. Edited and translated by J. HENDERSON. Loeb Classical Library 180. Harvard University Press, Cambridge (Mass.) – London 2002. ISBN 0-674-99596-1. 602 pp. GBP 14.50.

The final fourth Loeb volume of Aristophanes, freshly edited and translated by Jeffrey Henderson brings together the three last extant plays by the master of classic Attic comedy. It is the basic aim of the LCL to provide short introductory notes (including selective lists of manuscripts and annotated editions) for each play, followed by an edition with an English translation and extremely selective variant readings (written in Latin) together with explanatory comments on the text, doing the duties of a critical apparatus and a shortened commentary. All in all, the volume under review fulfills these aims very well: it does give the reader a comparably reliable text, and a stylistically appropriate, colloquial translation in American English. A synopsis or a note on the meters would be welcome.

The passage from the last really classical piece *Frogs* through the transitional *Assemblywomen* to the popular quasi-middle comedy *Wealth* is at least partly reflected in the shrinking numbers of variant readings (41, 32, 20, respectively), of comments (157, 78, 54, respectively), and of personal names, retrievable from the *Index* (86, 60, 27); it must be noted that the length of the plays shrunk around 25 to 20 percent, too.

Henderson's text relies only partly on the progress achieved by A. S. Sommerstein. Henderson adopts a smaller number of scholars' readings than his predecessor Sommerstein: in the *Frogs*, Henderson adopts 69 examples, but in the *Wealth* only 20 examples (in the *Wealth*, verses 98, 196, 216, 227, 271, 287, 300, 374, 391, 499, 514, 547, 596, 641, 792, 859, 946, 1078, 1120, and 1170). There are also alternative readings based on Henderson's own ideas (e.g., *Wealth*, verses 43, 45, and

688). Occasionally, this causes metrical irregularities (e.g., in *Frogs* 1335a) which — as they remain unexplained — may irritate some of us.

*Erkki Sironen*

*The Comedies of Aristophanes*. Vol. 9: *Frogs*, Vol. 11: *Wealth*. Edited with translation and notes by A. H. SOMMERSTEIN. Aris and Phillips Classical Texts, Warminster 1996, 2001. ISBN 0-85668-648-4. 312 pp. GBP 17.50 (Vol. 9, pb), ISBN 0-85668-739-1. 336 pp. GBP 17.50 (Vol. 11, pb).

Congratulations are due to Prof. Alan H. Sommerstein for having completed his 23 years long and conscientious labor of composing a full series of Aristophanes' comedies with introductions, texts and translations furnished with readable modern commentaries.

Both volumes under review here include a very handy list of references and abbreviations followed by a sensible introduction that elucidates the historical and cultural context. In the *Wealth* volume, the introduction has been further clarified by its eight subchapters; this would certainly have benefited the *Frogs* volume, also. A note on the text and a select bibliography are followed by the Greek text and English translation plus commentary. I find the note on the text with its sigla and other symbols explained, as well as the (reasonably selective) bibliography, very useful for both the beginning and the more advanced student.

In Sommerstein's hands, the textual form of the plays has progressed considerably: there are dozens of changes for the better. Instead of manuscript readings, Sommerstein quite often prefers the readings of earlier scholars: there are 77 examples of this in the *Frogs* and 40 in the *Wealth* (in *Wealth*, verses 98, 119–120, 171, 196, 216, 227, 271, 287, 293, 300, 368, 374, 391, 476, 499, 505, 514, 524, 537, 546, 547, 596, 598, 641, 677, 701, 792, 805a, 859, 870, 917, 946, 979, 1027, 1030, 1078, 1095, 1120, 1170, and 1173); because the critical apparatus is selective, a fuller account of manuscript readings must be retrieved from Coulon's old, but still acclaimed, edition in series *Collection Budé*. There are some mistakes in Sommerstein's Greek text, not only in the breathings and accents (e.g., in the *Frogs*, verses 215, 272, 366, 483, 492, 501 (twice), 518, 519, 581, 684, 699, 736, 749, 1187, 1198, 1469, and 1523; in the *Wealth*, verses 17, 367, 434, 447, 535, 543 (twice), 564, 637, 641, 678, 687, 706, 781, 881, and 1096).

Certainly numerous approaches to translating Aristophanes have been used during the past centuries, but this one is basically accurate, although also occasionally free (in such cases the literal translation is given in the commentary). The cues for the fast changing dialogue situations and staging, added in brackets, do help a lot. The spacious commentary, weighing various views argued by different scholars, testifies to Sommerstein's learning and humility — he confesses several times that he was wrong in his earlier publications. While giving a course on Aristophanes' *Wealth* this past autumn, I found the commentary excellent in many respects, but occasionally more comments on the language would have been useful: e.g., πλὴν with the nominative κολοσυρτόν in verses 535–536 raised questions from my students.

An extra bonus in the *Wealth* volume is the *Addenda* to all the previous 10