

La présentation typographique du livre est très soignée. On trouve ici et là des coquilles (lire *Theaetetus*, p. 10; *karterein* p. 22 et *karteria* p. 23; *proairesis* p. 36; Κυριακή p. 59, n. 2; HMIN p. 83, n. 145; *Alexandrie* p. 97, n. 238 et p. 171; ascétisme et siècle p. 106, n. 46 et p. 167; IXe p. 109, n. 70 et p. 170; seventeen p. 111; siècles p. 132, n. 6 et p. 168; Peña et Fernández pp. 137–9, nn. 45, 53, 54, 57 et p. 172; le *De monogamia* de Tertullien est donné par deux titres anglais différents p. 90, n. 188 et p. 91, n. 194; les premiers guillemets de la p. 116 ne se referment pas), quelques esprits et accents grecs erronés (p. 43, n. 40; p. 69, n. 62; p. 103, n. 22), ou une certaine inconséquence dans la translittération des mots grecs (e.g. *ascesis* pp. 11, 12, 19, 24 mais *askēsis* p. 95; *sophrosyne* p. 13 mais *hypomonē* p. 21; coenobitic p. 110 (bis), mais cenobitic pp. 129, 139, 143, 144, 153; *acedia* pour *akēdia* p. 123; Cyrrhus p. 131 mais Cyrhus p. 137).

Finn a bien étudié son sujet: on compte plus de 900 notes et presque vingt pages de bibliographie pour un livre de 150 pages! Ses idées sont claires et bien exprimées. Voir, par exemple, les pp. 100–04 où il parle de l'ascétisme chez Origène ou les pp. 94–7 où il résume de façon remarquable la théologie ascétique de Clément d'Alexandrie. Pourtant, on aimerait une présentation moins encyclopédique des auteurs du quatrième chapitre et une mise en évidence plus nette de l'influence d'Origène chez chaque auteur, puisque c'est le but de Finn.

Orestis Karavas

MAIJASTINA KAHLOS: *Forbearance and Compulsion. The Rhetoric of Religious Tolerance and Intolerance in Late Antiquity*. Duckworth, London 2009. ISBN 978-0-7156-3698-5. XII, 259 pp. GBP 50.

This book addresses an important and somewhat under-researched subject: rhetoric supporting religious moderation and conciliation in Late Antiquity, as well as its counterpoint, arguments favouring compulsion in order to reach religious unity in the realm. The dominant narratives have often been influenced by the retrospective perception of the success of one religious tradition over the others, but this simplified view has led many to overlook the polyphony (and, importantly, *calls* for polyphony) in Late Imperial religious discourse. The work is structured around concise, diachronically proceeding chapters, in the course of which Kahlos engages with a great number of sources from a wide variety of genres.

In the Introduction, Kahlos raises a number of very important questions regarding ancient discourse on religious moderation between 250 and 500 CE. She notes, for instance, that our sources are fundamentally removed from both the everyday life and the discourse of the non-elite (pp. 2–3). Kahlos proclaims her intention to focus on the rhetoric of moderation and compulsion instead of concrete acts, though admitting that historical circumstances and political acts must by necessity be discussed in the study. Of particular heuristic value is her choice of three (overlapping) viewpoints in the discourse: the imperial government and the ruling class; the 'lobbying' pressure groups; and the confessional groups and individuals advocating moderation.

The "Introduction" also gives some examples of the basic techniques of argumentation and binary oppositions used in the religious rhetoric of the age (p. 3), which is very instructive

– indeed, appetising – for the reader. The time-honoured categories, too, remained, although their properties could be renegotiated: the terms *religio* and *superstitio* continued to be employed despite the sea change in officially sponsored religion, as was the idea of a divinely ascertained triumphalism, or the concept of a 'loyal Roman' professing the correct form of religiosity.

Chapter 2 ("Articulating Forbearance and Compulsion before 250") harks by necessity back to even earlier Imperial conditions of religious plurality, but also achieves its purpose of setting the stage for the Late Imperial circumstances. Kahlos introduces complications to the received notion of inherently pluralistic and inclusive Greco-Roman polytheism: to accuse someone of impiety was far too effective a rhetorical tool not to be used even before the rise of monotheism. Concurrently, there always existed types of religiosity – as well as certain particular cults or doctrines – which were deemed substandard, and elicited disparaging or discriminating rhetoric. Instead of open-mindedness, the prevalent Roman attitude to religious diversity emerges as one permeated by pragmatism and interspersed by some stereotype-grounded mistrust. Among the most important reasons for any incidents of intolerance of cults was a fear of non-official cults introducing political or social instability; on the level of rhetoric, this was often garbed in the moralising argument of divine favour being forfeited by engaging in or tolerance of substandard religiosity. Treatment of the Jews (pp. 14–9) is taken up as an example of the nature of Roman pragmatism – as well as its limits – and from them the discussion flows smoothly to treat the first Christian apologists.

Chapter 3 ("The Third Century") demonstrates how Roman identity after the *Constitutio Antoniniana* increasingly became defined by sharing in the common religious observance, a shared ground that later became contested between Christianity and the traditional religion. The Third-century Crisis, moreover, seems to have emphasized the elite's desire to propagate religious – or more specifically, cultic – unity throughout the realm. The phraseology in edicts arguing for compulsion can be telling, often referring to disease, pollution, and destructiveness (p. 36); likewise, cessation of compulsion could be justified by the interest of the state (*utilitas publica*). Galerius' 311 act of toleration (pp. 33f.) reached for a compromise solution: the inclusion of the Christian god in the traditional pantheon as a recipient of a distinct cult and prayers for the safety of the emperor and the unity of the realm. The same period witnessed a rise in the political use of polemic accusations of persecution, exemplified by such writers as Lactantius and Eusebius. Kahlos also discusses with great acuity (pp. 38–46) the pagan pressure groups and 'lobbyists' – some whom argued for their "duty to oppress".

Chapter 4 ("From Constantine to Constantius II") examines the Constantinian rhetorical approach to the religious polyphony of the empire, the argumentative – though often ambiguously expressed – basis of which was founded on the commonalities of Christianity and monotheistic paganism. Sacrifice, the one aspect of pagan religiosity that the Christians appeared particularly unflinching about, was replaced by prayer as a sign of loyalty to the empire. The long scholarly tradition regarding this period necessitates Kahlos to review a great number of earlier studies, which she does in a judicious fashion. One might have wished for more discussion (for instance around pp. 60f.) about the extent to which the likes of Eusebius can be trusted to preserve Constantine's original rhetoric, or whether certain emphases were added in order to construct the image of a staunchly Christian ruler – an image from which some of the glory would trickle down to his entourage and biographer. In any case, Kahlos' warning (p. 65) against teleological fallacy in interpreting the imperial rhetoric favouring Christianity is very

apt and well put, as is her analysis of the transformation of the Christian rhetoric from that of the persecuted to that of the potential proponents of compulsion (pp. 66–72).

Chapter 5 ("From Julian to Valentinian I") is devoted to another period which has been extensively studied – partly no doubt due to the dramatic attraction of the idea of a pagan last stand sponsored by Julian. Kahlos shows that during his short rule the exacerbation in the religious rhetoric between Christians and pagans continued a trend that had already emerged before, as well as the mutual self-definition of these two identities by way of opposition. The rhetoric of the emperor portrayed as a harsh but patient physician aiming to heal the body politic is likewise a continuation from earlier rulers. Verbal continuation with earlier edicts of religious freedom is also evident in the legislation of the Valentinian dynasty. Later in the chapter, Themistius' polytheist call for plurality is studied in the light of the ongoing search for stability and compromise between the elite and the emperors (pp. 82–7). This rhetoric, too, was partly grounded on the common aspects of both contending religious traditions, but Kahlos also unearths a fascinating aspect of Themistian plurality, namely the call for beneficent agonism between Christianity and paganism – something which stems from the earlier expressions of "one goal, many paths" used by Porphyry and Lactantius.

Chapter 6 ("From Gratian to Theodosius I") covers a period when the traditional polar opposites *religio* and *superstitio* are often interpreted as having switched denominations: it was now the traditional religion that increasingly had to stave off accusations of *superstitio* or *de-isdaimonia*, something reflected in the rhetoric of Libanius and Symmachus (pp. 92–9). The same period saw increased inter-sectarian discrimination among the Christians, and a new intensity in negotiating what 'Romanness' entailed. Even Theodosius I, an emperor traditionally credited with delivering a serious blow to paganism, switched his attention from Arians to traditional polytheists comparatively late in his career (pp. 89ff.), and his actions were less comprehensive than sometimes depicted. The lobbying, however, intensified: against the eloquent pagan advocates for plurality, equally forceful arguments were put forward by well-connected Christian opinion leaders such as Ambrose. Especially in connection with the famous Altar of Victory case, the vociferous, even vindictive, objections of Ambrose vividly bring to the reader's mind the shrill remonstrations sometimes raised by certain modern majorities against "positive discrimination".

Chapter 7 ("After Theodosius I"), the last and most extensive diachronic chapter of the book, focuses on a period of increased sacralisation of the emperor into a more-than-mortal figure who preserved the empire by his own piety and particular connection with the divine. Consequently, a Christian emperor who tolerated heretics or pagans could by his negligence be insulting the divine, though during certain periods of crisis the resolve of the emperors seems to have foundered, leading to concessions (p. 107). It may be deterministic to claim that ecclesiastic lobbyists sniffed victory and thus pressed on with more zeal, but on the other hand, by this time the Christian notion of inexorably progressing salvation history was no doubt affecting their retroactive gaze. For Augustine, treated *in extenso* (pp. 111–33), violence and compulsion were acceptable in order to reach religious unity and convince unbelievers of Christianity's monopoly on truth.

Chapter 8, called "Towards a World of One Alternative", serves as a conclusion for Kahlos' valuable and learned book, reflecting on the broad trends and dynamics at play during Late Antiquity. The last chapters of *Forbearance and Compulsion* largely pertain to the same chronological context as Alan Cameron's recent *The Last Pagans of Rome* (2011), but this in

no way detracts from its conclusions. Both books naturally stem from the same scholarly tradition which seeks to call into question the image of a stark dichotomy between Christianity and paganism in Late Antiquity. But whereas Cameron's gaze and argumentation highlights and sustains the scholarly dichotomy between the 'old' bipolar understanding of Late Antique religious partisanship and the 'new' postmodern research tradition, Kahlos operates in a nuanced way within both the scholarly tradition and our extant sources, without getting bogged down in academic infighting.

Antti Lampinen

ELISA PELLEGRINI: *Eros nella Grecia arcaica e classica. Iconografia e iconologia*. Archaeologia Perusina 16. Giorgio Bretschneider editore, Roma 2009. ISBN 978-88-7689-222-2. 602 pp., 13 figg., 59 tavv. b/n. EUR 270.

Questo studio, nato da una tesi di dottorato (Perugia 2007), intende offrire al lettore un panorama complessivo sulla figura di Eros nella cultura greca arcaica e classica. La ricerca si dipana attraverso l'analisi di una grande quantità di fonti sia scritte che archeologiche, che possano illustrare la natura, l'iconografia e il culto della divinità. Particolarmente ricco risulta l'ampio catalogo del materiale iconografico ("Testimonianze figurate"), che ammonta a ben 2451 numeri (pittura, scultura, gemme, gioielli, ecc.), anche se poteva essere meglio organizzato, per facilitarne la consultazione tematica. Interessante anche l'esame nel secondo capitolo del motivo del genio alato ben presente nella pittura vascolare arcaica. L'identità di questa figura viene saggiamente lasciata aperta. Sono fornite fotografie, non tutte di ottima qualità, di una piccola parte degli esemplari trattati. Benché sia leggermente carente riguardo ai più recenti sviluppi metodologici, questo volume rimarrà senz'altro uno strumento indispensabile per i futuri studi "erotici".

Vengono elencate anche 37 testimonianze epigrafiche ("schede"). Ecco alcune note (per le iscrizioni di Tespie si veda ora Roesch, *Les inscriptions de Thespies*, éd. électr., 2007–09): N. 1: cf. *IG I³* 1382a. – 8: cf. *I.Prusa ad Olympum* T4. – 11: cf. Robert, *Hellenica* II, 5–6. – 12: Robert, *Ét. anat.* 141. – 13: *ibid.* 230. – 15: cf. *SEG XLVII* 518. – 17: cf. *SEG XLVIII* 82. – 20: si tratta delle stesse iscrizioni riportate sotto i nn. 32a–b; vd. anche Robert, *Ét. épigr. philol.* 59. – 27: cf. Pouilloux, *Choix d'inscr. gr.* 48; Pfohl, *Gr. Inschr.* 89; Guarducci, *Epigr. gr.* III 87 sgg.; Chapot-Laurot, *Corpus de prières gr. et rom.* G97. – 28: cf. *SEG XLVII* 2258.

Mika Kajava

DAVID WALSH: *Distorted Ideals in Greek Vase-Painting. The World of Mythological Burlesque*, Cambridge University Press, Cambridge – New York 2009 (pb 2014). ISBN 978-0-521-89641-2 (hb), ISBN 978-1-107-66965-9 (pb). XXIX, 420 pp. GBP 70.00 (hb), GBP 24.99 (pb).

In this book, Walsh deals with images on several different categories of Greek vases, e.g., on the Corinthian Komos vases, the Caeretan hydriai, the "phlyax" vases from Southern Italy, material from the Kabeirion sanctuary near Thebes, the Corinthian "Sam Wide" group, and vases